



# Criticisms & investigations

Center for preserving and publishing the works of Mansoor Hashemi Khorasani



**Code: 6**

**Necessity and feasibility of  
return to Islam**





*Bismillah Ar-Rahman Ar-Rahim*

**Author: Mojtaba Salehi**

**Date: 22/01/2015**

I read the book “Return to Islam” twice carefully. I did not understand it very well the first time, but I got it the second time. To be fair, it is a well-written and different book and I learnt a lot from it, especially from the parts it has explained cognition and its impediments, and the parts about the impediments to return to Islam, also my field of study is theology of religions and mysticism. In my opinion, these words they say that this book is deceptive and does not have reasoning and such, are absurd, because they themselves cannot write a book at this level, and if this book is deceptive, their books are blasphemies!! However, to be honest, I did not understand one part of the book and I have a problem and I think there is a contradiction. In one part, in the subject of “Performing some parts of Islam is contingent on performing the entire of it”, the author has said: “performing the Islamic Hadds<sup>1</sup> by those who do not know the entire laws of Islam and are not capable of administering all of them, is not permissible, without the legitimacy for non-performing the Islamic Hadds by them be permissible”! How is it possible that performing Islamic Hadds by them is not permissible and is also obligatory at the same time?! This is contradiction and impossible! Of course, maybe I am wrong. Please guide me.

**Answer to question: 2**

**Date: 22/01/2015**

Dear fair and truth-seeking brother!

If half of the people, or rather a tenth of them, or rather a hundredth of them had your spirit and had read the valuable book “Return to Islam” “carefully” and if necessary, had read it “twice” without preconception and prejudice and without paying attention to the propaganda of the biased and sick people, and had mentioned any questions or criticisms that had been brought to them to this informative website with politeness and respect and had received the answer and necessary

---

1 . [Translator note: Prescribed punishments]



explanation, the advent of Mahdi would have been very nearer and easier, but alas, not even a hundredth of the people are like you, and they do not open the book “Return to Islam” unless with preconception and prejudice, and they do not read it unless with carelessness and rush, and with the utmost inaction and credulity, get influenced by false and baseless propaganda against it, and they do not mention any of their questions and criticisms about it to this informatory website; because they basically have no question and criticism about it and do not seek to know the truth, and if they have any question or criticism about it, they mention it only to the arrogant people who also have not read this book better than them and are under the influence of false and baseless propaganda and have no occupation but preventing them from reading this book and paying attention to its informatory website, so that by closing their eyes and ears and tongue, deprive them of their freedom and free will and turn them into a wax in their hands. This is why they and their companions say on the Day of Judgment: ﴿رَبَّنَا إِنَّا أَطَعْنَا سَادَتَنَا وَكُبَرَاءَنَا﴾ (Al-Ahzab/ 67 and 68); “Our Lord! We obeyed our leaders and the elders, therefore they misled us! Our Lord! Make them suffer twice and give them a great curse”! So this is how they will regret their credulity and inaction against the oppressors on a day when this regret will not benefit them, and every lie and slander and hasty and unfair judgment done by them will be given punishment with fire; because they are not considered to be excused because of the propaganda of oppressors in denying the truth; given that God has given them intellect and has commanded them to hear all the words and follow the best of them, and the propaganda of the oppressors has always existed in history; because Satan never allows people to be easily guided, but rather, because he is “the clear enemy” of humankind, he does whatever he can to stop them from being guided and to do so, he uses all his human and jinn soldiers and takes advantage of all political, security and advertising tools, and this is a regular and usual procedure.

But in response to your question, dear brother, we should say that forbiddance of “performing the Islamic Hadds” for the culprits, along with its obligation upon them, can be from the aspect of the union of religious



order and prohibition in a single subject which is possible and has taken place; meaning that sometimes performing an obligatory action such as doing the prayer, conflicts with another obligatory action such as leaving extortion, in such a way that both cannot be done at the same time or can be from the aspect of forbiddance of doing something which has an introduction without doing the introductory act, which stems from the ill free-will of the obliged person, and this is more similar to the subject of the discussion; meaning that for example, performing prayer at the end of its due time is Munajjaz<sup>1</sup> and Muzayyagh<sup>2</sup> obligatory upon the obliged person, but it is not permissible without Wudu<sup>3</sup> or Tayammum<sup>4</sup>. It is clear that in such cases, the happened collision stems from the ill free-will of the obliged person and of course, it is not considered contradiction; because obligation and forbiddance of the action are not in one direction, but rather are in two different directions and with difference of the directions, the contradiction does not apply.

Yes, it comes from the words of his honor Mansoor Hashemi Khorasani that the obligation of “performing Islamic Hadd” upon Muslims is an implicit obligation; meaning that it is obligatory upon them during “performing the entire Islam” and otherwise, it is not obligatory upon them; like Ruku<sup>5</sup> which is obligatory during prayer and is not considered to be obligatory otherwise, although prayer is obligatory and accordingly, Ruku is also considered to be obligatory. Therefore, if someone does not do prayer and instead only does Ruku, has not done prayer as much as Ruku and has not received portion of its reward, rather his Ruku outside prayer is invalid and does not suffice anything of prayer. Performing Islamic Hadd, like Ruku in prayer, is

- 1 . [Translator note: “A Munajjaz obligatory deed” is an obligatory deed and its obligation is not dependent on the realization of any other deed.]
- 2 . [Translator note: “A Muzayyagh obligatory deed” is an obligatory deed which the determinate time for it by the Legislator is as much as the time needed for the deed itself and its performing time.]
- 3 . [Translator note: the act of washing face and hands and touching head and toes in preparation for prayers]
- 4 . [Translator note: Touching the hands and forehead using dust or stone in preparation for prayers when water is not available]
- 5 . [Translator note: the act of bowing toward Mecca i.e. direction of Qibla during prayer. Ruku is followed by Sajda i.e. prostration]



also obligatory during performing the entire Islam and doing it alone is not rational, and is not beneficial; rather it is derived from the words of his honor Mansoor Hashemi Khorasani that it is probably harmful and can be forbidden; because in a part of his valuable book (page 128 and 129), he has said:

“The punitive laws of Islam, have been put into place on the credit of complete realization of Islam, in accordance with time and location that the other laws of Islam were also in effect as preventive factors and with those laws being in effect, there will be no cause for committing crimes and accordingly once a crime is committed in this condition, it is unnatural and requires due punishment. As for instance, the judgment for amputation of the thieves’ hands, is set upon the credit of complete realization of Islam and appropriate to the time and location that the economic laws of Islam and preventive actions of it such as fair distribution of the wealth and taxes such as Zakat and Khums have been performed; not in the time and location where the economic laws of Islam have not been performed and the wealth distribution is oppressive and the taxes such as Zakat and Khums are not being paid as it should be and hence there is exigency for theft and its impediment is absent. This means that if one commits a robbery at the time of a non-Islamic ruling and a location where the original and general laws of it are not administered, one is not entitled to the due punishment for robbery and execution of that punishment toward him, is unjust and contrary to the legislator’s purpose. As execution of other punitive laws, is pending on realization of Islamic government and administration of the original and total laws of Islam and before that, it is not useful and is inappropriate; since God has legislated those laws to be executed in His government and in accordance with a certain time and location that someone on behalf of Him, with complete knowledge of all of it and complete capability for conforming it to its instances, holds office and administers His government based on that and manifests His justice; as the major executor of the laws at the time of rev-



elation, has been the prophet and this reality has influenced the legislations and has been observed in their legislation; to the extent that it is not far-fetched that if those laws were revealed for someone other than his highness or even someone just similar to him, they would have had a different nature.”

The result is that it is obligatory upon Muslims to perform Islamic Hadds through making Mahdi peace be upon him reappear and giving him the sovereignty, and if they do not make his excellency reappear and do not give him the sovereignty, performing Islamic Hadds by them is like praying without Wudu or doing Ruku without praying.

Center for preserving and publishing  
the works of Mansoor Hashemi Khorasani  
The section for studying criticisms

